Making Waves: Advocating for Immunizations
Non-legislative Policy Approaches to Improving Vaccination Rates with

*Carrots, Sticks and Nudges*

California Immunization Coalition Summit ~ April 15, 2013
Michelle T. Parra, Ph.D.
Director, Immunization Program, LA County Department of Public Health
Presentation Objectives

Participants will be able to:

• Identify psychological principles of motivation re: health choices
• Name at least three strategies for increasing IZ coverage rates without the use of policy
• Describe ways to engage community partners in efforts to increase IZ rates
• Describe “incentive” programs that have been implemented as a method of increasing IZ rates
Alternative Approaches to Policy

- Public health policies are designed to produce outcomes that individuals are unlikely or unable to produce on their own*

- However, policy is not always necessary…

- How Do We By-Pass Policy?

- And Why Might We Want To?

Carrots & Nudges
SEMINAR TODAY

MOTIVATING
YOUR STAFF

FRANKLY, I WAS EXPECTING
SOMETHING A BIT MORE SOPHISTICATED...
Motivational, Behavioral, Cognitive... Theories

• More Theories than Hypotheses...
Health Belief Model (HBM)

Premise Depends on perceptions in the following 4 areas:

- The severity of a potential illness
- The person’s susceptibility to that illness
- The benefits of taking a preventive action, and
- The barriers to taking that action

*Seydel et al. 1990; Schwarzer 1992
Health Belief Model (HBM)
Rosenstock, 1960, 1966

- Severity
- Susceptibility
- Threat
- Benefits
- Barriers
- Health Behavior
- Cues to Action
Evidence Against the HBM

• On one hand, studies have found the best predictors of health behavior to be:

• perceived barriers

• perceived susceptibility to illness
Evidence Against the HBM

• 19 studies using a meta-analysis that included measures of the HBM to predict compliance, found that the best predictors of health compliance are:
  – the costs and benefits
  – The perceived seriousness

So… there is lack of agreement over what really does help to predict health behavior.
Reworking of HBM – Protection Motivation

**Intention** to protect oneself is the proximal determinant of health behavior

- Severity
- Susceptibility
- Self-Efficacy
- Coping Efficacy
- Response Efficacy

Intention to protect oneself is the proximal determinant of health behavior.
Figure 2: Overview Motivation Theories (Author’s own: 2011)
Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs

- Physiological
- Safety
- Love and Belonging
- Esteem
- Self-Actualization
Assumptions in Health Psychology

1. Humans are rational in their information processing. It is the role of perceived factors (e.g. risk, rewards, costs, etc) rather than actual risks.

2. Different cognitions are separate from and perform independently from each other.
Assumptions in Health Psychology

3. The types of cognition may not really exist nor play a part in the patient's thinking about their health.

4. Cognitions are not placed within a context. For example, actual social pressure and environment are not taken into account, only the individual's interpretation of social pressure and environmental influences.
Relevant Motivation Theories

- **Extrinsic Motivation**: external: tangible rewards or consequences (e.g. not getting/getting VPD)

- **Intrinsic Motivation**: internal: value-based, (e.g. looking out for the good of all)

- **Reactance Theory**: discomfort when freedom is threatened (e.g. when mandates are imposed).
Relevant Motivation Theories cont.

- **Affect Perseverance**: Preference persists after disconfirmation (e.g. Wakefield debunked, yet...).

- **Attitude-Behavior Consistency**: factors that align attitude and behavior (e.g. stories about adverse events).

- **Disconfirmation bias**: Agreeing with what supports beliefs and vice versa (e.g. answer shopping).

- **Opponent-Process Theory**: opposite emotions interact (e.g. I want my child to be safe, but I don’t want to put him in harms way).
The Nudge as Intervention

Aims to suggest one choice over another by gently steering individuals towards welfare/health-enhancing directions without imposing significant limits on available choices.
Two Cognitive Systems

Automatic System
- Uncontrolled
- Effortless
- Associative
- Fast
- Unconscious
- Skilled

Reflective System
- Controlled
- Effortful
- Deductive
- Slow
- Self-aware
- Rule-following
3 keys functions related to Nudges (which Play on Automatic Cognition)

- Anchoring – Information Presented
- Availability – Recency Effect
- Representativeness (how similar is A to B…or How similar are people who are getting sick to me?)
Avoidant Thinking
Avoidant Thinking

Simultaneously reduces fear of the threat and weakens intentions to adopt an adaptive response*

*Rippetoe and Rogers, “Effects of components of protection-motivation theory on adaptive and maladaptive coping with a health threat.”
Unrealistic Optimism

- Unrealistic optimism focuses on perceptions of susceptibility and risk.
- One of the reasons why people continue to practice unhealthy behaviours is due to inaccurate perceptions of risk and susceptibility

Unrealistic Optimism cont.

- The belief that if the problem has not yet appeared (in my house/neighborhood), it will not appear in the future
- The belief that the problem is infrequent (people believe in the lottery but not that VPD existence)
So What Can We Do About all of this?
Increasing Use of Non-Compulsory Vaccination Strategies

- Australia – National Level Incentive Program that provides stipends to families with fully vaccinated children
- Provider reminder systems – to ensure all medical encounters are utilized to assess patients for needed vaccinations
- School located vaccination programs – shown to be effective where capacity exists
DON’TS

• Don’t be afraid to be an advocate
• Don’t be bullied by the misinformed
• Don’t assume that people know what you do
• Don’t underestimate the power of story
DO’S

• Engage Community Members as Partners
• Listen to the fears of the Vaccine Hesitant and address them head on
• Address the potential risks to those too young to be vaccinated as well as the elderly
• Use reminder recall diligently and regularly
• Increase awareness of the threat of VPDs wherever and whenever possible
• Promote better understanding of Herd Immunity
ENGAGING COMMUNITY PARTNERS

• FIRST – Definition of Community must be agreed upon MacQueen et al. 2001

• Community Building and Organizing Involving Youth

• Approach community partners with the mindset that they know as much and likely more about the community needs, wants and fears
SHARE SOME IDEAS ABOUT HOW TO ENGAGE COMMUNITIES!

THANK YOU!

QUESTIONS?